A Systematic Literature Review of Technology Transfer Office: Research Trends, Methods, and Topics

Darminto Pujotomo
Syed Ahmad Helmi Syed Hassan
Azanizawati Ma’aram
School of Mechanical Engineering, Faculty of Engineering
Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, Skudai, 81310, Johor, Malaysia
pujotomo@graduate.utm.my
helmi@utm.my
niza@utm.my
Wahyudi Sutopo
Industrial Engineering Department, Faculty of Engineering
Universitas Sebelas Maret, Surakarta Indonesia
wahyudisutopo@staff.uns.ac.id

Abstract

This study aims to review literature in Technology Transfer Offices (TTO) which identifies and analyzes the research trends, methods, and topics, and directions for future research. The methodology used in this paper is a systematic literature review, which collects data from the Scopus and Web of Science databases and based on the specified research questions, 86 papers selected objectively were published from 2000 to May 2020. This study finds a sharp growth of publications on the topic after 2000 until now. Journal of Technology Transfer is the journal that has the most articles with a total of seventeen articles, and the most active authors with a minimum of three articles in the TTO field of four authors. The topics in the TTO field are grouped into seven groups, role of TTO, assessment, measurement, and performance of TTO, organizational structure of TTO, collaboration forms, model of TTO, commercialization, and knowledge transfer. Moreover, the research methods used are quantitative method, qualitative method and mixed-method, and data collection methods are interviews, analyzing previous data/databases, questionnaires, surveys, and case studies. Research tools used are regression, multi-criteria and decision making (MCDM), literature review, multivariate analysis, descriptive statistics, design experiment, focus group discussion, and empirical analysis. The findings and future research directions of the study offers a new avenue for further exploration and contribution to this discipline.

Keywords
Technology Transfer Offices, Collaboration, Assessment, and Model

1. Introduction

Technology transfer office (TTO) is committed and facilitates the process of transfer [1] and commercialization of academic knowledge [2], and as an intermediary supplier or promoters of innovation and technology for those who have the potential to commercialize it [3]–[5]. Researchers [6], [7] have conducted in-depth studies related to the role and the underlying factors of TTO in the transfer of knowledge from research universities to industry, meanwhile [8] making the conceptual framework of TTO as knowledge brokers. In [9] stated that the TTO as a knowledge broker, which impacts socio-economic benefits, also plays a role in increasing university income and job creation in the region.

TTO has a role as a seller of technological inventions from several research laboratories at universities and can build a reputation [10], technology transfer [11] and creation of spin-offs [12], [13]. Several studies [14]–[17] have discussed other roles of TTO. Various forms of TTO collaboration with other parties, have been widely studied, namely long term partnership and contract [18]–[22], networks [23]–[27], patenting and licensing [28], [29]. The role of the TTO in various activities shows that this is an important part of university-based research.
This study aims to identify and analyze the research trends, collaborations, assessment, and frameworks and directions for future research in TTO from papers and articles of the journal between 2000 to May 2020.

This article is organized as follows: section one is an introduction to the theme “technology transfer office”; section two, outlines of review methodology; section three, descriptive statistics and finally, section four is review discussion.

2. Review Methodology

In research work and making research maps, the literature review is one of the important things. Based on the analysis of the literature review, the research gaps will be formulated. The methodology performed in this paper is a systematic literature review [30] and refers to the stages that have been done in two papers from [31], [32]. These stages can be explained in 3 stages: planning, development/conducting, and reporting/results.

2.1. The Planning Stage

In this stage, the formulation of the research question (RQ) and the type of document/publication to be used is determined. The formulation of the RQ can be seen in table 1 and the type of document/publication chosen is the article in the two electronic journal databases from Scopus and Web of Science (WoS) core.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Research Question</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RQ1</td>
<td>Which journal is the most significant TTO journal?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RQ2</td>
<td>Who are the most active and influential researchers in the TTO field?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RQ3</td>
<td>What kind of research topics are selected by researchers in the TTO field?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RQ4</td>
<td>What kind of methods and data collection techniques is the most used for TTO research?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.1. The Development/Conducting Stage

At the development/conducting stage, the process carried out is a selection of digital libraries, defining keywords of title and search string, retrieving an initial list, exclusion of primary studies based on full text and making a final list of include primary studies. The process in detail can be seen in Figure 1.

![Figure 1 The flowchart of the development stage](image)

The keywords of the title used in this literature review are based on [27] which states that the similarities in the definitions of Knowledge Transfer Offices (KTO) is TTOs (Technology Transfer Offices), ILOs (Industrial Liaison Offices) Offices of Technology Licensing (OTLs) and UTTOs (University Technology Transfer Offices). In translating keywords, the search string is used and the number of articles found can be seen in table 2. The number of articles from two journal databases is 155 articles (88 articles from Scopus and 67 articles from Web of Science). After reading the full and in-depth text articles, there were a total of 86 articles that met the criteria.

2.3. The Reporting/Results
The reporting/results consist of the results from the descriptive statistics, reviews and discussions that have been carried out will be presented, shown in Sections 3 and 4. These will answer the research questions (RQ) stated in section 2.1.

### Table 2. Keywords used to search articles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scopus</th>
<th>Web of Science</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TITLE (&quot;Techno® Transfer Office®&quot; OR &quot;Knowledge Transfer Office®&quot; OR &quot;University-Industry Technology Transfer&quot; OR &quot;technology licensing office®&quot;) AND DOCTYPE (ar OR re) AND PUBYEAR &gt; 1999 AND (LIMIT-TO (LANGUAGE, &quot;English&quot;))</td>
<td>(T1=&quot;Techno® Transfer Office®&quot; OR &quot;Knowledge Transfer Office®&quot; OR &quot;University-Industry Technology Transfer&quot; OR &quot;technology licensing office®&quot;) AND LANGUAGE: (English) AND DOCUMENT TYPES: (Article) Timespan: 2000-2020. Indexes: SCI-EXPANDED, SSCI, A&amp;HCI, CPCI-S, CPCI-SSH, BKCI-S, BKCI-SSH, ESCI.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 3. Descriptive Statistics

#### 3.1. Number of Article and Cite Number of Article

This sub-section, will answer RQ 1 and RQ 2, related to articles, journals and author used in this study will be explained statistically using Microsoft Excel. Based on eighty-six articles on TTO showing increasing trends every year. A significant increase in the number of items began in 2010 to the present. In 2017 is the year with the highest amount of TTO research. Figure 2 shows the detail number of article per year and trend from TTO research. The increasing number of article per year show that TTO has a significant impact on commercializing university research result [25].

![Figure 2. Number of Articles per year](image)

The number of article databases that use in this research is fifty-three journals. Figure 3 shows fourteen journals, which have at least 2 articles related to TTO, and the most prominent place to publish articles is "Journal of Technology Transfer" where seventeen articles have been posted. Based database July 2020, the majority of the fourteen journals in the Scopus and Web of Science databases have indexes in Q1 and Q2 except for the Journal of Technology Management and Innovation in Q3 and International Journal of Innovation in WoS.

#### 3.2. Co-occurrence keywords, average publication year, and Author

Figure 4 illustrates keywords from research in the field of TTO and their co-occurrence relationships. By using Vosviewer software, the results are grouped into 4 clusters and are distinguished by colour. Cluster #1 is red, consisting of 9 items related to TTO and entrepreneurship, while Cluster #2 is green, consisting of 9 items focusing on technology transfer and innovation. Cluster #3 is blue, consisting of 9 items concerning university-industry and knowledge, and finally, Cluster #4 with yellow, consisting of 4 items related to university, spin-offs and patents.
The results of more detailed information from the Vosviewer software, related to the co-occurrence keywords can be seen in table 4. There are 31 items/keywords obtained if at least 1 keyword is used at least 3 times, with the 5 keywords most frequently used in this research are keywords related to technology transfer (Occ. = 41, TSL = 114), technology transfer offices (Occ. = 33, TSL = 62), innovation (Occ. = 14, TSL = 36), engineering education (Occ. = 10, TSL = 29), and university sector (Occ. = 9, TSL = 40). These keywords are important in determining TTO research topics and connecting key branches of science. According to the average publication year (APY), the keywords related to academic entrepreneurship (2018.33), entrepreneurial university (2017.29) and knowledge transfer (2016.00) are the keywords used in this recent research.

The authors who were active in the TTO articles between 2000 and May 2020 are shown in figure 5. They wrote at least 3 documents, either as main author or co-authors. They are Christle De Beer, Cornelius S. L. Schutte, Mike Wright, and Donald S. Siegel. In writing collaboration between Christle De Beer and Cornelius S. L. Schutte, they had written three articles together.

### 3.3. Topics of Research in TTO
This sub-section will answer RQ 3, related to topics of research in TTO. TTO has an important role as a bridge between academia and industry [1] and investors through sharing knowledge and innovation [33]. Many research topics are related to the field of TTO. In this review, the articles are grouped into 7 topics and 1 group others that consist of several topics, which can be seen in Table 5.

### 3.4. Methods and Data Analysis

This sub-section will answer RQ 4, related to methods and data collection techniques are the most used for TTO research. The methods from the previous study divided into a quantitative method, qualitative method and mixed-method. The most significant research method is qualitative methods (40.6%), then followed by almost the same value of methods are qualitative, and the most significant ways are to collect the data are conduct interviews. Table 6 show tools that used to collect data from articles consist of an interview, analyzing previous data, questionnaire, survey and case study. Interview stakeholders that involve in TTO are the most significant method. This data collection method has a strong relationship with the type of research from the previous study. From previous studies, the most significant methods are qualitative, and the most significant ways are to collect the data are conduct interviews. Table 6 show research tool and article that use this data collection technique.

© IEOM Society International
After knowing the most data collection technique, summary about research tools in technology transfer offices showed in table 7. From this review, it is known that the most significant method in TTO research is to make the multi-criteria and decision making (MCDM) method, multivariate analysis, followed by a regression model by looking at the relationship between the dependent and independent variables.

Table 7. Summary research tools.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Research Tools</th>
<th>Articles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Regression</td>
<td>[21], [82], [64], [73], [86], [94]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCDM</td>
<td>[5], [21], [47], [49], [59], [61], [63]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literature review</td>
<td>[93], [45], [52], [74], [79]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multivariate analysis</td>
<td>[7], [11], [93], [50], [55], [61], [70]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Descriptive statistics</td>
<td>[71], [94]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Design Experiment</td>
<td>[12]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus Group Discussion</td>
<td>[69], [99]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empirical analysis</td>
<td>[8], [33], [71]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.3. Reviews and Discussions

This study aims to review literature in TTO which identifies and analyzes the research trends, methods, and topics and directions for future research, based on a systematic literature review. The development of research in the field of TTO published in journals has increased from year to year, and the majority are published in journals relating to technology and innovation. From articles that have been published in the journal, will result in methods, collecting data, and data analysis used and identification of TTO topics that provide opportunities for further research.

In data collection, something is interesting, that is the development of internet technology has helped accelerate this process through websites and online access. The use of online technology began in 2014, including the use of databases and annual reports from the TTO and KTO websites, verifying secondary data with data from websites, online surveys, online questionnaires, e-mail, and determining respondents obtained from the University's official website. From the results of this article, most data collection techniques are interviews and done offline. While other data collection techniques have been done online, except for case studies. There are great opportunities in the future to be done face-to-face online both in interviews and case studies. In future research, these are opportunities and challenges for online use in accelerating, simplifying, and saving the costs of research activities.

When related to the five keywords most frequently used in this research in the TTO field, those keywords are related to technology transfer, technology transfer offices, innovation, technical education, and the university sector, so this is highly correlated with the topics. Most TTO research fields have topics related to role, assessment, measurement, and performance of TTO, then followed by topics related to organizational structure, collaboration forms, models, commercialization, and knowledge transfer. Identification of TTO topics will provide opportunities for further research.

© IEOM Society International
TTO topics have important opportunities to be developed, one of which is the topic of the role of TTO in the role of the process of research activities into a commercial process. The role of the TTO in the process are as facilitating the transfer of knowledge/technology from universities to industry, the commercial exploitation of research results, fostering patent and intellectual property, licensing university inventions, building legitimacy, creation of spin-offs, development of university start-ups, accommodate the specific needs of global spin-offs companies. Besides the role in the process, there are also others, such as a knowledge broker, an intermediary between suppliers of innovations and those who can potentially commercialize them, as an attraction for venture capital to fund spin-off companies, science and technology entrepreneurship education (STEE), facilitating the third mission of the university in community engagement activities, an innovation promoter in regional development, and a guideline for assessing the economic impact of universities’ R&D. TTO has many roles, as already mentioned, but there is no research related to how the role of TTO in accelerating the process of academic research to the commercialization process.

In the topic of commercialization, several articles discuss commercialization strategies, ‘repeat commercializers’, legal path for commercialization and the critical determinants of commercial orientation. Articles related to commercialization strategies, discussing licensing and spin-off strategy, the influence of autonomy, age, and membership into an association of technology transfer office with strategy. There are opportunities in the future related to research, how to shorten time to market and reduce investment costs in the commercialization process.

References


Proceedings of the 5th NA International Conference on Industrial Engineering and Operations Management
Detroit, Michigan, USA, August 10 - 14, 2020

015-9398-7.


[34] A. Huyge, M. Knockaert, M. Wright, and E. Piva, “Technology transfer offices as boundary spanners in the


Biographies

**Darminto Pujotomo** is a PhD student in the School of Mechanical Engineering of Universiti Teknologi Malaysia (UTM) and Associate Professor in the Department of Industrial Engineering, Faculty of Engineering, Diponegoro University, Indonesia. He earned B.S. and Masters in Industrial Engineering & Management from Institut Teknologi Bandung, Indonesia in 1998 and 2002. He has published journal and conference papers and his research interests include procurement, pricing, engineering economy & cost analysis, and technology commercialization. He has received some research grants from Directorate Higher Education, Ministry Education and Culture and Diponegoro University.

**Syed Ahmad Helmi** is a faculty member at the Faculty of Engineering, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia. He received his Bachelor of Science in Mechanical Engineering, Master of Engineering in Advanced Manufacturing, and PhD in Engineering Education. He is currently a fellow at the Centre for Engineering Education, and head of the university’s Research Group in Engineering Education (RGEE). His recent work includes academic change management, complex engineering problems, manufacturing systems and optimization, supply chain, and systems dynamic modelling. Over the years, he has conducted several workshops on Outcomes-Based Education (OBE) particularly in Student-Centred Learning (SCL) throughout Malaysian Higher Institutions, and International Institutions such as in Indonesia, Korea, India, China, Turkey, Morocco, Qatar, South Africa, Pakistan, and Afghanistan. Throughout his career, he received several awards such as teaching excellence award, excellent service awards, best paper awards, and gold medals in innovative practices in higher education. He has published several books and more than 100 papers in journals and conference proceedings.

**Azanizawati Ma’aram** is a senior lecturer at the School of Mechanical Engineering, Faculty of Engineering, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia (UTM). She obtained her Bachelor of Engineering (Mechanical-Industrial) and Master of Engineering (Advanced Manufacturing Technology) from Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, Malaysia. She pursued her Doctorate of Philosophy (PhD) (Management) at the University of Liverpool, United Kingdom. She has held several positions including Head of Industrial Panel, Postgraduate Coordinator for Master of Science (Industrial Engineering), and Laboratory Coordinator for Industrial Engineering. She is certified as an Engineering Technologist (Ts.) from the Malaysia Board of Technologists (MBOT). She is a member of the International Association of Engineers (IAENG) and the Board of Engineers (BEM) Malaysia. She has taught courses in industrial engineering, supply chain management (undergraduate and postgraduate levels), engineering management and safety, work design, ergonomics and research methodology. Her research interests include supply chain management, performance...
measurement, lean manufacturing, sustainability, ergonomics, safety and medical devices. She is currently active as a Project Leader and a Project Member on numerous research projects and has secured several grants funded by the university, Ministry of Education (MoE) and industrial grants that involve hospitals, industry collaborators as well as international collaborators.

**Wahyudi Sutopo** is a Professor in Industrial Engineering and Coordinator of Industrial Engineering and Techno-economy (RITE) Research Group, Dept. of Industrial Engineering, Faculty of Engineering, Universitas Sebelas Maret, Indonesia. He earned his PhD in Industrial Engineering & Management from Institut Teknologi Bandung in 2011. He has published journal and conference papers and his research interests include logistics & supply chain management, engineering economy & cost analysis, and technology commercialization. He has received more than 30 research grants. Dr Wahyudi Sutopo has done research projects with Indonesia Endowment Fund for Education (LPDP), Sustainable Higher Education Research Alliances (SHERA), MIT-Indonesia Research Alliance (MIRA), PT Pertamina, Tbk, PT Toyota Motor Manufacturing Indonesia, and various other companies. He is a member of IIE and IEOM.