

A Review of Paradiplomacy Literature: Mini-Review Approach

Risky Novialdi, Rohana Ahmad, Zikri Muhammad, Jumadil Saputra

Faculty of Business, Economics and Social Development

Universiti Malaysia Terengganu

21030 Kuala Nerus, Terengganu, Malaysia

hera.aldyra@gmail.com, rohana@umt.edu.my,

zikri@umt.edu.my, jumadil.saputra@umt.edu.my

Abdul Talib Bon

Department of Production and Operations

Universiti Tun Hussein Onn Malaysia

86400 Parit Raja, Johor, Malaysia

talibon@gmail.com

Abstract

Paradiplomacy is the practice of international relations carried out by sub-state actors in a country. Along with the development of international relations practices, sub-state actors such as provinces and cities also have the authority to carry out foreign cooperation. Through international cooperation with provinces or cities in other countries, provinces or cities will have the opportunity to meet their own specific needs. In this regard, this paper will present a mini-review of the literature related to the study of paradiplomacy. This paper presented a summary and analysis based on the findings found in the journal articles. A Mini-review on paradiplomacy was conducted by reading and analysing 30 journal articles. These articles are summarised in two tables below. The first table contains information about the journal article regarding the title, authors, publishers, and publication year. The second table represents the journal articles' contents, including the title, objectives of the study, results, and recommendations. There were various findings obtained from analysing this journal article; first, there were still unclear provinces regarding the institution that had the authority to conduct international relations within the framework of paradiplomacy. The institutions were very important in optimising the practice of paradiplomacy. Second, the provincial / city orders have not yet understood the practice of paradiplomacy. Provinces/cities were only waiting for instructions from the central government regarding international cooperation. Third, the practice of paradiplomacy is suspected as a way for the province to get support from international parties to have legality and international recognition. The central government's position had the highest authority and had obliged to supervise paradiplomacy activities carried out by each province of the country. There was no space for separatist groups to find international support.

Keywords

Paradiplomacy, soft power, development, mini-review approach

1. Introduction

Diplomacy is a political activity and well-resourced and skilled, is an essential element of the power to reach an agreement. Its primary objective is to enable the state to secure its foreign policy objectives without force, propaganda, or the law. Therefore, diplomacy consists of communications between officials designed to promote foreign policy through formal agreements or tacit adjustments. This also includes different activities such as gathering information, clarifying intentions, and generating goodwill. It is not surprising that, until the label 'diplomacy' was affixed to

Edmund Burke's activities in 1796, it was most known as 'negotiation' - by cardinal Richelieu as *négociation* continuously. Diplomacy is not only carried out by professional diplomatic agencies. It is done by other officials and private persons under the official's direction (Berridge, 2015). However, in the development of diplomatic activities, currently, diplomacy is more dynamic with increasingly diverse power and actors.

Actors in the science of international relations and diplomacy have changed. Those who play a role in the interaction between other countries or other parties abroad also develop can be done by actors who the central government has given authority. One of them is the role of sub-countries, such as the province or even a city. Cities are the oldest political entities in history and played an essential political role until the Middle Ages when the nation-state's advent in the 1500s reduced them to relatively insignificant political players. However, the growth of globalisation in the 1990s and the rapid growth of urban areas worldwide, demanding environmental degradation solutions, public transport, housing, education, health, and public services, have once again brought cities to the political forefront (Rodrigues and Mattioli, 2017). But in this era of globalisation, provinces and cities can develop their regions through the practice of paradiplomacy. Paradiplomacy is a new phenomenon in the study of international relations. The concept refers to what can describe as the "foreign policy capacity" of sub-state entities, their participation, regardless of their central state, in the international arena in pursuing their particular international interest. It is a conceptually and practically challenging development. Conceptually, because the discipline of international relations is usually not the state actors and international organisations are more dominant, sub-states are not considered the subject of international relations (Wolff, 2007).

Currently, Regions and cities are important international actors. Suppose the international community has always been aware of some United States (such as California or Texas) or territories that use foreign policy to take advantage of their internal autonomy (such as Quebec or Catalonia), now practice. In that case, this phenomenon shows that regions and cities already have a special place in international relations dynamics. Local governments are concerned with what has traditionally been defined as "low policy": environmental concerns, investment promotion, cultural and educational exchanges, etc. This is in stark contrast to the "high policy," represented by the central government's diplomatic and military security plans. In other words, paradiplomacy represents the projection of subnational governments' domestic competence abroad, mostly concentrated on these "low policy" issues (Tavares, 2016). The concept of paradiplomacy has several derived concepts that are often used in the technical implementation of paradiplomacy practices. These concepts are Sister Province, Sister City, and Twin City. Also, there is also another concept, namely, Protodiplomacy. The concept of Protodiplomacy is a concept of foreign cooperation practiced by the Sub-state to obtain foreign parties' support. In this regard, this paper will present a mini-review of the literature related to the study of paradiplomacy. This paper presented a summary and analysis based on the findings found in the journal articles.

2. Method

A Mini-review on paradiplomacy was conducted by reading and analysing 30 journal articles. These articles are summarised in the tables below. Table 1 presents the journal article's information regarding the title, authors, publishers, and publication year. Table 2 represents the journal articles' contents, including the study's objectives, the findings, and the recommendations. The analysis results from some of these kinds of literature will focus on the position and concentration in paradiplomacy.

Table 1. Journal and Publisher Distribution

No	Article Name	Author(s)	Journal	Publisher	
1	Paradiplomacy and the Future of Aceh Government	Takdir Ali Mukti	AGC 2018	Atlantis Press	2018
2	Paradiplomacy Management and Local Political Movement in Aceh, Indonesia, and Catalonia, Spain	Takdir Ali Mukti, Tulus Warsito, Surwandono, Idham Badruzaman, and Ulung Pribadi	European Journal of East Asian Studies	Brill	2019
3	East Asian subnational government involvement	Martin Kossa, Marina Lomaeva	The Pacific Review	Taylor & Francis	2020

	in The Arctic: a case for paradiplomacy?	& Juha Saunavaara			
4	Diplomacy and paradiplomacy in the redefinition of international security: Dimensions of conflict and cooperation	Noé Cornago	Regional & Federal Studies	Taylor & Francis	1999
5	Paradiplomacy, Security Policies and City Networks: the case of the Mercocities Citizen Security Thematic Unit	Gilberto Marcos Antonio Rodrigues & Thiago Mattioli	Contexto internacional	SciELO Brasil	2017
6	Going Beyond Paradiplomacy? Adding Historical Institutionalism to Account for Regional Foreign Policy Competences	Peter Bursensa and Jana Deforcheb	The Hague Journal of Diplomacy	Brill	2009
7	Paradiplomacy and The Future of Cooperation Between Regions	Muhammad Yami and Arif Darmawan	International Conference on Public Management	Atlantis Press	2014
8	Paradiplomacy and Indonesian Public Diplomacy	Sri Issundari	(ICESAME 2018)	Atlantis Press	2018
9	The Internationalisation of Regions: Paradiplomacy or Multi-level Governance?	Francesca Dickson	Geography Compass	Wiley Online Library	2014
10	Iraqi Kurdistan Region: from paradiplomacy to protodiplomacy	Yasin Mahmood Ababakr	Review of Economics and Political Science	Emerald	2020
11	Europe and Beyond: The Development Of Sub-State Paradiplomacy With Special Reference To Catalonia	Gary Chambers	Romanian Journal of Society and Politics	Ceeol	2012
12	Political Issues of Paradiplomacy: Lessons from the Developed World	André Lecours	Netherlands Institute of International Relations' Clingendael'	Desiree Davidse	2008
13	Theory and Practice of Paradiplomacy	Alexander S. Kuznetsov	Routledge New Diplomacy Studies	Routledge	2015
14	Green paradiplomacy and water resource management in North America: the case of the Great Lakes- St. Lawrence River Basin	Annie Chalouxa & Stéphane Paquinb	Canadian Foreign Policy Journal	Taylor & Francis	2013

15	Making sense of paradiplomacy? An intertextual enquiry about a concept in search of a definition	Iñaki Aguirre	Regional & Federal Studies	Taylor & Francis	1999
16	Decentralisation in International Relations: A Study of Semarang City's Paradiplomacy	Hermini Susiatiningsih, Nadia Farabi, Satwika Paramasatya, and Sheiffi Puspapertiwi	ICENIS 2018	E3S-Conferences	2018
17	Paradiplomacy, protodiplomacy and the foreign policy aspirations of Quebec and other Canadian provinces	James T. McHugh	Canadian Foreign Policy Journal	Taylor & Francis	2015
18	Diasporas as Non-Central Government Actors in Foreign Policy: The Trajectory of Basque Paradiplomacy	Gloria Totoricagüena	Nationalism and Ethnic Politics	Taylor & Francis	2005
19	Local Government Paradiplomacy in the UK: The Case of the Kent-Virginia Project	Rebecca Casson & Paolo Dardanelli	Local Government Studies	Taylor & Francis	2012
20	Paradiplomacy and political geography: The geopolitics of substate regional diplomacy	Thomas Jackson	Geography Compass	Wiley Online Library	2017
21	Paradiplomacy and the democratisation of foreign policy in South Africa	Fritz Nganje	South African Journal of International Affairs	Taylor & Francis	2014
22	Paradiplomacy and the International Competitiveness of Cities: the case of Rio de Janeiro	Marcos Vinícius Isaías Mendes & Ariane Roder Figueira	Revista Brasileira de Política Internacional	SciELO Brasil	2017
23	Paradiplomacy as a Diplomatic Broker Between Separating Differences and Engaging Commonalities	Manuel Duran	Brill Research Perspectives in Diplomacy and Foreign Policy	Brill	2016
24	Paradiplomacy as a Provincial State-Building Project: The Case of Yunnan's Relations With the Greater Mekong Subregion	Czeslaw Tubilewicz	Foreign Policy Analysis	OUP	2016
25	Between intergovernmental relations and paradiplomacy: Wales	Jo Hunt and Rachel Minto	The British Journal of Politics and International Relations	SAGE	2017

	and the Brexit of the regions				
26	The cultural paradiplomacy of Barcelona since the 1980s: understanding transformations in local cultural paradiplomacy	Mariano Martín Zamorano & Arturo Rodríguez Morató	International Journal of Cultural Policy	Taylor & Francis	2014
27	Paradiplomacy: Reflections on the Foreign Policy and International Relations of Regions	André Lecours	International negotiation	Brill	2002
28	Commercial Interests and Calculated Compassion: The Diplomacy and Paradiplomacy of Releasing the Lockerbie Bomber	Daniel Kenealy	Diplomacy & Statecraft	Taylor & Francis	2012
29	The Architecture of Paradiplomacy Regime In Indonesia: A Content Analysis	Surwandono and Ali Maksum	GLOBAL Gurnal Politik Internasional	global.ir.fisip.ui	2020
30	From Sub-state Nationalism to Subnational Competition States: The Development and Institutionalization of Commercial Paradiplomacy in Scotland and Quebec	Hubert Rioux Ouimeta	Regional & Federal Studies	Taylor & Francis	2015

Table 2. Articles Category Based on the Subject

No	Article Name	Objectives	Findings	Recommendations
1	Paradiplomacy and the Future of Aceh Government	To study the obstacles for the province of Aceh in practicing Paradiplomacy	The obstacles experienced by the Aceh government in the practice of diplomacy are due to the ineffective institutional authority. Besides that, it is also due to the lack of soft power possessed by the Aceh government	Aceh must develop soft power so that it can be more optimal in paradiplomacy practice

2	Paradiplomacy Management and Local Political Movement in Aceh, Indonesia, and Catalonia, Spain	This research aims to examine the similarities and differences in paradiplomacy practices between the Provinces of Aceh and Catalunya	The study's findings indicate that the two regions have similarities in authority in paradiplomacy practice, and political activities or movements influence paradiplomacy activities in the areas	There needs to be a special study of paradiplomacy governance in the Aceh provincial government, whether to follow a concept like in Catalonia, or to build its own concept under the Indonesian unitary state system.
3	East Asian subnational government involvement in The Arctic: a case for paradiplomacy?	To examine the motives of the East Asian regional government in the Arctic Ocean	This article argues that East Asian regional governments' motives in the Arctic Ocean are based on economic goals, particularly those associated with new transportation routes.	It is important to study the role of local government in an area. For example, in East Asia, local governments are always interactive with the central government regarding regional problems.
4	Diplomacy and paradiplomacy in the redefinition of international security: Dimensions of conflict and cooperation	To reflect on the position of paradiplomacy practice in understanding international security.	The analysis results in this study indicate that certain forms of paradiplomacy can be offered as an instrument to reduce transnational ethnic tensions.	Regarding the impact of paradiplomacy cooperation on security, this article offers that paradiplomacy practice will reduce the level of transnational ethnic tensions.
5	Paradiplomacy, Security Policies and City Networks: the case of the Mercocities Citizen Security Thematic Unit	To explain cities' role (in the Paradiplomacy concept) in realising international security.	Paradiplomacy has become an increasingly important means of horizontal public policy exchange between local governments. The findings presented in the research show that city networks have played an important role due to their ability to record and share experiences and good practices that can be applied in similar local contexts elsewhere, even in other countries. A case in point is the Mercocities Network, one of the most active and influential networks in Latin America and has contributed to horizontal policy exchanges and policy transfers.	Inter-city cooperation, a form of foreign cooperation practice, is crucial in today's international politics. Through paradiplomacy networks, problems will be more easily resolved together with inter-city cooperation.

6	Going Beyond Paradiplomacy? Adding Historical Institutionalism to Account for Regional Foreign Policy Competences	To study the concept of paradiplomacy. In strengthening the concept of paradiplomacy, it is necessary to study it from an institutionalist perspective.	This study concludes that there is a combined impact from internal and external in the constitutional and institutional context on foreign organisations and European policy-making.	There is a need for a study in the future on historical paradiplomacy and institutionalism to see the dynamics of paradiplomacy and the paths that must be followed and the selection of priority partners to cooperate.
7	Paradiplomacy and The Future of Cooperation Between Regions	To explain the state's role in international cooperation and local governments' position as paradiplomacy actors.	Current forms of foreign cooperation are more participatory for all international actors, both at the state and local levels as well as the institutional and individual levels. The state's role began to diminish because other actors such as provinces and cities began to carry out their foreign cooperation with other provinces and cities abroad; this practice is better known as paradiplomacy.	The current central government must provide space for local governments to carry out foreign cooperation. Centralism in government cannot limit local government in terms of thinking and regulation. Paradiplomacy cooperation provides space for local governments to determine policy directions for their regional development.
8	Paradiplomacy and Indonesian Public Diplomacy	To study paradiplomacy activities can be a way to support public diplomacy.	This research shows that local governments' existence of international cooperation can encourage outsiders' closeness and appreciation within the Indonesian government's framework of public diplomacy.	There needs to be an increase in paradiplomacy because paradiplomacy will support public diplomacy carried out by the central government in a country.
9	The Internationalisation of Regions: Paradiplomacy or Multi-level Governance?	To explore the relationship between a region and external parties.	This study concludes that multi-level governance creates a governance structure based on an activity undertaken. Therefore, the practice of paradiplomacy can provide broad enough authority in carrying out activities based on regional autonomy.	The study of paradiplomacy must shift from only descriptive to explanatory so that the problems of governance and paradigmatic practice appear clearer and do not show ambiguity.

10	Iraqi Kurdistan Region: from paradiplomacy to protodiplomacy	To examine the orientation of separatist groups in the practice of paradiplomacy in the Kurdistan Region	Separatist groups in the Kurdistan region are motivated to carry out Paradiplomacy in the context of nationalism but then move towards protodiplomacy practices to build an independent country.	It is important to have written and unwritten statements related to the constitution's consistency as an effort to oversee paradiplomacy practices so as not to fall into protodiplomacy practices that could threaten the country's sovereignty.
11	Europe and Beyond: The Development of Sub-State Paradiplomacy With Special Reference To Catalonia	To explore the phenomenon of the paradiplomacy of Sub-State governments in the dynamics of European nation-state transformation as a result of globalisation and regionalisation.	This article will argue that the national government of a country does not monopolise effective political power, but it is distributed effectively between national, regional, and international levels.	It is necessary to redefine the concept of foreign politics. The central government can no longer monopolise foreign policy but must also share with other actors such as provinces and cities.
12	Political Issues of Paradiplomacy: Lessons from the Developed World	To explore technical matters that can be done in optimising paradiplomacy practices in an ever-developing world.	From this research, several rights can be utilised from the practice of paradiplomacy and ways that can be done so that this paradigm can be more effective. First, paradiplomacy can serve many different purposes, including economic development, cultural development, technological progress, and political progress. Second, the development of paradiplomacy must adapt to domestic conditions. Third, Paradiplomacy presents opportunities and pitfalls for democratic development, especially in developing countries	developing countries must learn from industrialised countries about how to maximise paradiplomacy practices. It is necessary to be careful in the practice of paradiplomacy, because this could be a threat to the unitary state.
13	Theory and Practice of Paradiplomacy	To explain the practice and concept of paradiplomacy	Paradiplomacy is a political activity carried out by local governments to meet specific needs in regional development efforts. Nationalism is also an important component in paradiplomacy activities.	Paradiplomacy is a necessity for current international relations activities. Through paradiplomacy practices, local governments (provinces and cities) can meet their specific needs.

14	Green paradiplomacy and water resource management in North America: the case of the Great Lakes-St. Lawrence River Basin	To respond to certain literature gaps by developing a descriptive analysis that focuses on a specific case study, the Great Lakes Board of Governors, and its recent agreement, the "Great Lakes-St. Lawrence River Basin Sustainable Resources Agreement.	This study emphasises the need for a broader perspective in studying the environment and its governance processes. Including local government involvement. This is because sub-national governments are increasingly involved in sustainable development policies, including in the case of the environment	All states in the United States must adopt regional agreements so that the problems at hand can be resolved together.
15	Making sense of paradiplomacy? An intertextual enquiry about a concept in search of a definition	To describe paradiplomacy.	This article concludes that the practice of paradiplomacy is needed in line with the increasing complexity of the dynamics of international politics, public policies, and making people closer to citizens, including citizens across countries.	non-central governments (NCGs) can be very important because their movements go beyond nation-states.
16	Decentralisation in International Relations: A Study of Semarang City's Paradiplomacy	To analyse how Semarang, as a melting pot city in Java, positions itself in the international community and develops its paradigmatic practice.	This study finds that the Semarang City Government with broad powers through the concept of decentralisation in Indonesia uses paradiplomacy to achieve economic interests, especially to expand markets and attract foreign investment.	As the capital city of Central Java, Semarang has characteristics and good locality that can be used in paradiplomacy practice
17	Paradiplomacy, protodiplomacy and the foreign policy aspirations of Quebec and other Canadian provinces	To study the paradiplomacy and protodiplomacy are under international law, neither paradiplomacy nor protodiplomacy qualifies strictly as "diplomacy."	The analysis results in this article show that while neither paradiplomacy nor protodiplomacy qualifies, strictly speaking, of "diplomacy," they do provide an opportunity to advance "diplomatic" goals that, simultaneously, can benefit Canada as a central government.	Additional resources are needed to promote the region in paradiplomacy practices, which will benefit the countries and regions.
18	Diasporas as Non-Central Government Actors in Foreign Policy: The Trajectory of Basque Paradiplomacy	To examine the aims of the Basque government's paradiplomacy practice.	In this study, it was found that local governments, including the Basques, carried out paradiplomacy practices for activities that were beneficial to their regions	In the practice of paradiplomacy, power is not static but dynamic so that it provides space in promoting diaspora identity.

19	Local Government Paradiplomacy in the UK: The Case of the Kent-Virginia Project	To investigate the Kent-Virginia Project, a recent partnership between the Kent County Council (KCC) and the US state of Virginia, as a form of paradiplomacy practice in the UK.	These findings suggest that UK local governments can engage in ambitious projects through paradigmatic practices but that such activities occur within an uncertain legal framework, which raises many questions.	There is a need for the central government's involvement in paradiplomacy, as a supervisor and provider of information to local governments to be effective in paradiplomacy practices.
20	Paradiplomacy and political geography: The geopolitics of substate regional diplomacy	To examine and offer a theoretical view of paradiplomacy from a geopolitical point of view.	The conclusion presented in this paper is that by building methodological insights based on geopolitical perspectives, it is possible to offer a multi-scalar analysis of paradiplomacy, contributing to the ongoing political geography project. Also, it also strengthens understanding of paradiplomacy in regional and international contexts.	There needs to be a geopolitical study relatedness in learning about paradiplomacy. The involvement of geopolitical studies on paradiplomacy will advance theories and views on regional politics.
21	Paradiplomacy and the democratisation of foreign policy in South Africa	To examine the practice of paradiplomacy in three provinces in South Africa. Its main objective is to see the extent to which provincial governments' foreign relations can represent a model of the foreign policy democratisation process.	The findings presented in this study indicate that in the absence of an effective and clear mechanism to promote deliberation, accountability, transparency, and representation in the province, the practice of paradiplomacy is nothing more than a monopoly of sub-national elites in the international arena.	It takes a strong institution at the provincial level so that there is an institution that coordinates paradiplomacy practices and also needs central government involvement in supporting this process.
22	Paradiplomacy and the International Competitiveness of Cities: the case of Rio de Janeiro	To evaluate the paradiplomacy carried out by the local government of Rio de Janeiro.	The results show that Rio de Janeiro's international engagement grew long after the announcement as the host of the 2016 Olympics. This suggests that a trust given to the region to carry out international events will increase the city's exposure to paradiplomacy practices.	When implementing paradiplomacy practices, it is necessary to determine priority parties who will be invited to cooperate.
23	Paradiplomacy as a Diplomatic Broker Between Separating Differences and	To study the activity of paradiplomacy, the diplomatic practice of sub-state entities, as a	Paradiplomacy practices initially confined themselves often to one-dimensional approaches	There is a need for further research on paradiplomacy that focuses on studying political separation. Then

	Engaging Commonalities	particular means of diplomatic mediation. Apart from that, in the dynamics of power and the desire to connect with other people.	or approaches to their diplomatic activities. In the absence of important political hostilities with the central government or regulations in their constitutions, some sub-state entities concentrate on a series of largely humanist policies. In addition, the system of development cooperation is decentralised, turning it into a variety of meeting facilities with local authorities, NGOs, companies, and individuals.	also about the different levels of governance into multi-level governance.
24	Paradiplomacy as a Provincial State-Building Project: The Case of Yunnan's Relations With the Greater Mekong Subregion	To describe Yunnan's relationship with the Greater Mekong Subregion (GMS) countries that are members of the Asian Development Bank (ADB).	The central government has authorised the Yunnan government to be proactively involved in the GMS Program's multilevel governance. At the same time, the government retains the highest authority by providing funding and preferential policies for internal Yunnan in economic projects and determining Yunnan's parameters in its activities within the GMS and ADB.	It is important for a study of domestic political economy, not only to see the impact of globalisation. In addition, it is also interesting to note the coordination between the central government and the provincial government in the formulation of foreign policy.
25	Between intergovernmental relations and paradiplomacy: Wales and the Brexit of the regions	To discuss the interests of one regional case, Wales, to be accommodated in the pre-negotiation phase, at the domestic level, and the European Union level through paradiplomacy.	This article concludes that Wales' behavior reflects its position as one of the countries that are both good in the ties of the United Kingdom and the European Union's internal context. Wales is more focused on pursuing policy influence at the UK (not EU) level. In Brussels, regional interests inform the context of Brexit. Here, Wales focuses on raising awareness and highlighting that the British government has not ordered a 'monopoly of perspective' on Brexit in Great Britain.	Affirmation that Wales is a post-Brexit "Good European" because it remains engaged in collaborative and constructive engagement with the UK government.

26	The cultural paradiplomacy of Barcelona since the 1980s: understanding transformations in local cultural paradiplomacy	To explain the institutional conditions and the emergence of Barcelona's cultural paradiplomacy practice and its impact on the region.	This study indicates that in economic globalisation, the emergence of a cultural paradigm is closely related to the restructuring of the state and its external administration. Apart from that, the intensification of city 'cultural branding' as a means of global competition. The recognition of Barcelona as an actor in international interactions stems from its economic activity evolution at the international level.	In paradiplomacy practice, the government acts as a facilitator. However, the local government still determines its direction according to its specific needs.
27	Paradiplomacy: Reflections on the Foreign Policy and International Relations of Regions	To explain new international actors, external-internal relations, and the expansion of the boundaries of international relations and negotiations. This journal aims to reveal new actors in the form of regions in international relations interactions.	This paper's results indicate that local governments' international activities raise several global political actors and international negotiations. These issues can be external-internal linkages by scholars of international relations.	This article suggests not neglecting the local government entities in the practice of international cooperation; in the last few decades, local governments have taken great advantage in their international cooperation interactions.
28	Commercial Interests and Calculated Compassion: The Diplomacy and Paradiplomacy of Releasing the Lockerbie Bomber	To explain the dynamics of paradiplomacy practices carried out by the Scottish government, especially in the context of The Diplomacy and Paradiplomacy of Releasing the Lockerbie Bomber.	The release of the only person convicted of the bombing of Pan-Am Flight 103 over Lockerbie, Scotland, in December 1988 was the most significant diplomatic decision taken by the Scottish government. British policy is directed by its national interest in securing Libya's rehabilitation into the international community and safeguarding British business. The Scottish paradiplomacy shifted from a strategy of avoidance to one of advancing their ideas of independence. Scotland exhibits a series of entities that differ in	Paradiplomacy practice allows two actors, state and sub-national, to have different interests in foreign policy.

			legal, cultural, and value contexts and their ability to exist as independent actors in international interactions.	
29	The Architecture of Paradiplomacy Regime In Indonesia: A Content Analysis	The big question raised in this article is what the Indonesian paradiplomacy architecture looks like in the structure of local government policies. Are Indonesia's paradiplomacy policies very substantial or procedural?	This article finds that Indonesia's paradigmatic architecture is still very administrative, procedural, and technical, which results in an inability to accelerate paradiplomacy by local governments in Indonesia to improve the effectiveness of paradiplomacy practices to extend regions.	The Indonesian government must make more flexible regulations to make it easier for local governments to practice paradiplomacy.
30	From Sub-state Nationalism to Subnational Competition States: The Development and Institutionalization of Commercial Paradiplomacy in Scotland and Quebec	To describe the development and Institutionalisation of paradigmatic practices in Quebec and Scotland over the past 50 years.	This article describes the development of paradiplomacy in an autonomous context by focusing on nationalism as an important matter. To ensure these activities, different organisations and institutions have been formed in Canada and the UK.	This article recommends a special study of commercial paradiplomacy, and the impact of sub-state nationalism on policy-making.

3. Result and Discussion

A total of 30 Journal articles have been systematically summarised and reviewed using the title, author, year, research objectives, and research results. Several things were found: First, there were still unclear provinces regarding the institution that had the authority to conduct international relations within the framework of paradiplomacy. The institutions were vital in optimising the practice of paradiplomacy. Institutions that can carry out foreign cooperation and with adequate resources will further increase foreign cooperation's quantity and productivity. Second, the provincial / city orders have not yet understood the practice of paradiplomacy. Provinces/cities were only waiting for instructions from the central government regarding international cooperation. As in diplomacy involving state actors, power is significant in maintaining bargaining with foreign countries. Hard Power and Soft Power are the main things in cooperation between regions abroad (paradiplomacy). Third, the practice of paradiplomacy is suspected as a way for the province to get support from international parties to have legality and international recognition. The central government's position had the highest authority and had obliged to supervise paradiplomacy activities carried out by each province of the country. There was no space for separatist groups to seek international support. Several regions in the world in the region of Iraq, Canada, Spain, and even in Southeast Asia, identified that foreign cooperation is a practice of protodiplomacy, which is a way for provincial governments to seek final support for foreign cooperation activities in struggling independence.

4. Conclusion

Paradiplomacy is indeed a new phenomenon in the study of international relations. As the era develops and actors are promoted in global interactions, it has opened enormous opportunities for sub-states (Provinces and Cities) to engage in international relations with other provinces and cities abroad. The practice of international cooperation carried out by the province and city governments will develop the region more maximally and according to each region's needs. Several things that need attention are the institutions with capabilities in foreign cooperation in the provincial and city governments. Provincial and city governments must also be aware of their strengths to determine what power will be used as capital in the practice of paradiplomacy. Furthermore, there is also the collaboration between the central

government and local governments in the success of the paradiplomacy practice, so there is no suspicion of foreign cooperation, which is indicated as seeking regional separatism support.

References

- Ababakr, Y. M. (2020). Iraqi Kurdistan Region: from paradiplomacy to protodiplomacy. *Review of Economics and Political Science*. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1108/REPS-01-2020-0002>
- Aguirre, I. (1999). Making sense of paradiplomacy? An intertextual enquiry about a concept in search of a definition. *Regional & Federal Studies*, 9(1), 185-209. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1080/13597569908421078>
- Berridge, G. R. (2015). *Diplomacy: theory and practice*. Springer.
- Bursens, P., & Deforche, J. (2010). Going beyond paradiplomacy? Adding historical institutionalism to account for regional foreign policy competences. *The Hague Journal of Diplomacy*, 5(1-2), 151-171. DOI: 10.1163/187119110X12574289877281
- Casson, R., & Dardanelli, P. (2012). Local government paradiplomacy in the UK: the case of the Kent-Virginia Project. *Local Government Studies*, 38(5), 599-614. DOI: 10.1080/03003930.2012.666213
- Chambers, G. (2012). EUROPE AND BEYOND: THE DEVELOPMENT OF SUB-STATE PARADIPLMACY WITH SPECIAL REFERENCE TO CATALONIA. *Romanian Journal of Society and Politics*, 7(1), 7-26.
- Chaloux, A., & Paquin, S. (2013). Green paradiplomacy and water resource management in North America: the case of the Great Lakes-St. Lawrence River Basin. *Canadian Foreign Policy Journal*, 19(3), 308-322. DOI: 10.1080/11926422.2013.845582
- Cornago, N. (1999). Diplomacy and paradiplomacy in the redefinition of international security: Dimensions of conflict and cooperation. *Regional & Federal Studies*, 9(1), 40-57. DOI: 10.1080/13597569908421070
- Dickson, F. (2014). The Internationalisation of Regions: Paradiplomacy or Multi-level Governance?. *Geography Compass*, 8(10), 689-700. DOI: 10.1111/gec3.12152
- Duran, M. (2013). An archaeology of Mediterranean diplomacy: the evidence of paradiplomacy. *International Journal of Euro-Mediterranean Studies*, 5(2), 147-158. DOI: 10.1007/s40321-013-0007-y
- Duran, M. (2016). Paradiplomacy as a diplomatic broker: Between separating differences and engaging commonalities. *Brill Research Perspectives in Diplomacy and Foreign Policy*, 1(3), 1-56. DOI: 10.1163/24056006-12340003
- Hermi, S., Nadia, F., Satwika, P., & Sheiffi, P. (2018). Decentralisation in International Relations: A Study of Semarang City's Paradiplomacy. In *E3S Web of Conferences* (Vol. 73, p. 09016). EDP Sciences. DOI: 10.1051/e3sconf/20187309016
- Hunt, J., & Minto, R. (2017). Between intergovernmental relations and paradiplomacy: Wales and the Brexit of the regions. *The British Journal of Politics and International Relations*, 19(4), 647-662. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1177/1369148117725027>
- Issundari, S. (2018, July). Paradiplomacy and Indonesian Public Diplomacy. In *2018 3rd International Conference on Education, Sports, Arts and Management Engineering (ICESAME 2018)* (pp. 156-159). Atlantis Press. DOI: 10.2991/amca-18.2018.44
- Jackson, T. (2018). Paradiplomacy and political geography: The geopolitics of substate regional diplomacy. *Geography Compass*, 12(2), e12357. DOI: 10.17863/CAM.18686
- Kenealy, D. (2012). Commercial Interests and Calculated Compassion: The Diplomacy and Paradiplomacy of Releasing the Lockerbie Bomber. *Diplomacy & Statecraft*, 23(3), 555-575. DOI: 10.1080/09592296.2012.706542
- Kossa, M., Lomaeva, M., & Saunavaara, J. (2020). East Asian subnational government involvement in the Arctic: a case for paradiplomacy?. *The Pacific Review*, 1-32. DOI: 10.1080/09512748.2020.1729843
- Lecours, A. (2008). Political issues of paradiplomacy: lessons from the developed world. *The Hague: Netherlands Institute of International Relations' Clingendael*.
- Lecours, A. (2002). Paradiplomacy: reflections on the foreign policy and international relations of regions. *International negotiation*, 7(1), 91-114. DOI: 10.1163/157180602401262456

- McHugh, J. T. (2015). Paradiplomacy, protodiplomacy and the foreign policy aspirations of Quebec and other Canadian provinces. *Canadian Foreign Policy Journal*, 21(3), 238-256. DOI: 10.1080/11926422.2015.1031261
- Mendes, M. V. I., & Figueira, A. R. (2017). Paradiplomacy and the International Competitiveness of Cities: the case of Rio de Janeiro. *Revista Brasileira de Política Internacional*, 60(1). DOI: 10.1590/0034-7329201700103
- Mukti, T. A. (2019, January). Paradiplomacy and the Future of Aceh Government. In 1st Aceh Global Conference (AGC 2018) (pp. 50-56). Atlantis Press. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.2991/agc-18.2019.8>
- Mukti, T. A., Warsito, T., Badruzaman, I., & Pribadi, U. (2019). Paradiplomacy Management and Local Political Movement in Aceh, Indonesia, and Catalonia, Spain. *European Journal of East Asian Studies*, 18(1), 66-92. DOI: 10.1163/15700615-01801003
- Nganje, F. (2014). Paradiplomacy and the democratisation of foreign policy in South Africa. *South African Journal of International Affairs*, 21(1), 89-107. DOI: 10.1080/10220461.2014.895082
- Rioux Ouimet, H. (2015). From sub-state nationalism to subnational competition states: the development and Institutionalisation of commercial paradiplomacy in Scotland and Quebec. *Regional & Federal Studies*, 25(2), 109-128. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1080/13597566.2014.992886>
- Rodrigues, G. M. A., & Mattioli, T. (2017). Paradiplomacy, security policies and city networks: the case of the Mercocities Citizen Security Thematic Unit. *Contexto internacional*, 39(3), 569-587. DOI: 10.1590/s0102-8529.2017390300006
- Sanalla, M. (2014). The Phenomenon of Paradiplomacy in the Czech Republic: Representative Difficulties in the Concept of Paradiplomacy in the Subnational Unit of the Znojmo Region. *İstanbul Gelişim Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 1(1), 159-172. DOI: 10.17336/igusbd.73524
- Surwandono, S., & Maksum, A. (2020). The Architecture of Paradiplomacy Regime in Indonesia: A Content Analysis. *Global: Jurnal Politik Internasional*, 22(1), 77-99. DOI: 10.7454/global.v22i1.443
- Tavares, R. (2016). *Paradiplomacy: cities and states as global players*. Oxford University Press.
- Toricagüena, G. (2005). Diasporas as non-central government actors in foreign policy: The trajectory of Basque paradiplomacy. *Nationalism and Ethnic Politics*, 11(2), 265-287. DOI: 10.1080/13537110591005757
- Tubilewicz, C. (2017). Paradiplomacy as a provincial state-building project: the case of Yunnan's relations with the greater Mekong subregion. *Foreign Policy Analysis*, 13(4), 931-949. DOI: 10.1093/fpa/orw022
- Wilson III, E. J. (2008). Hard power, soft power, smart power. *The annals of the American academy of Political and Social Science*, 616(1), 110-124. DOI: 10.1177/0002716207312618
- Wolff, S. (2007). Paradiplomacy: scope, opportunities and challenges. *The Bologna Center Journal of International Affairs*, 10(1), 141-150.
- Yami, M., & Darmawan, A. (2014, August). Paradiplomacy and The Future of Cooperation Between Regions. In 2014 International Conference on Public Management. Atlantis Press. DOI: 10.2991/icpm-14.2014.54
- Zamorano, M. M., & Rodríguez Morató, A. (2015). The cultural paradiplomacy of Barcelona since the 1980s: understanding transformations in local cultural paradiplomacy. *International Journal of Cultural Policy*, 21(5), 554-576. DOI: 10.1080/10286632.2014.943752

Biographies

Risky Novialdi is a junior lecturer who teaches in the International Relations major at Almuslim University, Aceh, Indonesia. I was born in Kutablang, Aceh Province, on November 14, 1990. I have completed my undergraduate and master's program at the Muhammadiyah University of Yogyakarta and currently continuing the doctoral program at the Terengganu University of Malaysia. My research interests are in the field of Paradiplomacy and international development, and also International Islamic studies. Some of the article titles I have written include: Optimising the Ability of Aceh Province in Paradiplomacy Practice, The Failure of Providing Human Security For Rohingya Refugees (Case Study: Escaping Rohingya Refugees From Shelter In SKB Bireuen, Aceh Province), The Public Diplomacy of International Communications, etc.

Rohana Ahmad is a Lecturer at Faculty of Business, Economics, and Social Development, Universiti Malaysia Terengganu, Malaysia. Her research areas are social development and political studies.

Jumadil Saputra is a PhD holder and works as a senior lecturer in the Department of Economics, Faculty of Business, Economics, and Social Development, Universiti Malaysia Terengganu, Malaysia. He has published 125 articles Scopus/ WoS indexed. As a lecturer, he has invited as a speaker in numerous universities, the examiner (internal and external), the reviewer for article journal and proceeding, the conference committee, journal editorial board, and others. He is a professional member of the International Business Information Management Association (IBIMA), Ocean Expert: A Directory of Marine and Freshwater Professional, and Academy for Global Business Advancement (AGBA). His research areas are Quantitative Economics (Microeconomics, Macroeconomics, and Economic Development), Econometrics (Theory, Analysis, and Applied), Islamic Banking and Finance, Risk and Insurance, Takaful, i.e., financial economics (Islamic), mathematics and modeling of finance (Actuarial). His full profile can be accessed from <https://jumadilsaputra.wordpress.com/home-2/>.

Zikri Muhammad was born in Terengganu, Malaysia. He received the bachelor's degree in business administration from Universiti Putra Malaysia in 1999, the M.A. degree from Universiti Sains Malaysia, and the Ph.D. degree in geography from Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia. From 2012 to 2016, he was a Senior Lecturer with the School of Humanities, Universiti Sains Malaysia for five years. He is currently a Senior Lecturer with the Faculty of Business, Economics and Social Development, Universiti Malaysia Terengganu. His research interests include urban geography, sustainable development, quality of life, and local government.

Abdul Talib Bon is a professor of Production and Operations Management in the Faculty of Technology Management and Business at the Universiti Tun Hussein Onn Malaysia since 1999. He has a PhD in Computer Science, which he obtained from the Universite de La Rochelle, France in the year 2008. His doctoral thesis was on topic Process Quality Improvement on Beltline Moulding Manufacturing. He studied Business Administration in the Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia for which he was awarded the MBA in the year 1998. He's Bachelor degree and diploma in Mechanical Engineering which his obtained from the Universiti Teknologi Malaysia. He received his postgraduate certificate in Mechatronics and Robotics from Carlisle, United Kingdom in 1997. He had published more 150 International Proceedings and International Journals and 8 books. He is a member of MSORSM, IIF, IEOM, IIE, INFORMS, TAM and MIM.